

|                      |   |             |             |
|----------------------|---|-------------|-------------|
| <b>Meeting name</b>  | White Bay Cruise Terminal - Meeting with Balmain Residents Representatives and Government Agencies  |             |             |
| <b>Date</b>          | 21 August 2015  | <b>Time</b> | 11:00-12:30 |
| <b>Location</b>      | Port Authority of New South Wales<br>Level 4, 20 Windmill Street, Walsh Bay   |             |             |
| <b>Meeting chair</b> | Christa Sams, Port Authority of New South Wales   |             |             |
| <b>Minute taker</b>  | Liz Barry, Port Authority of New South Wales  |             |             |
| <b>Attendees</b>     | Kerin Cox (Resident), Kate Horrobin (Resident), Lisa-Marie Murphy (Resident), Alan Rosen (Resident)<br>Ryan Cole (Leichhardt Council), Anita Smojver (Leichhardt Council)<br>Frank Garofalow (EPA), Sarah Deards (EPA), Claire Miles (EPA), Mike Sharpin (EPA), Anthony Savage (EPA)<br>Leena Gupta (NSW Health), Graham Burgess (Health), Richard Broome (Health)<br>Karen Harragon (Planning), Alix Carpenter (Planning)<br>Joe James (Port Authority), Brendan Elliott (Port Authority), Christa Sams (Port Authority) |             |             |

## Apologies

*These minutes are a summary record of what was stated at the meeting as they relate to actions, and do not necessarily reflect the views of all attendees.*

## Minutes

### 1. Welcome

### 2. Apologies

Maree Thomas (Resident), Brad Milner (Port Authority)

### 3. Minutes of previous meeting

No further changes were requested and the previous meeting minutes were adopted as an acceptable record of what was stated.

### 4. Discussion arising from Minutes

In response to the query, CS reported that the *Superstar Virgo* is booked to stay for one night only on 9 December.

KC noted there did not appear to be any reduction in noise from the Princess fleet through fitting variable speed fans.

### 5. Update from Residents

K Horrobin noted that the air emissions from the *Pacific Pearl* on Saturday 15 August led her vacate her home, and that this ship is louder than before for some reason. A recording was played from a house on Grafton Street of the noise emanating from the PA system of the ship, a song named "Play that funky music white boy."

It was noted that ship bookings for 2016 had increased and in February 2016 there are two nights when two ships are berthed overnight at WB4 and WB5, which is concerning to the community.

---

K Horrobin will send through further information on increased ship stays. KC said residents are being assaulted with record arrivals scheduled at White Bay Cruise Terminal.

AR noted that there are now ship bookings for conventions at sea for the Aria and Eden through Carnival. AR to send through further information.

Residents noted the increase in respiratory problems coinciding with more ships arriving at White Bay.

AR noted that Public Health need to monitor health effects in the community and set a baseline study of the community that can be made public.

**Action:** Further information to be provided by residents as noted above.

---

## 6. Update from Port Authority of NSW

BE noted that a new after-hours phone answering service starting from 18 August is in operation, provided by Service NSW on behalf of Port Authority. Matters phoned through to the main switch or enquiries line (9296 4999 and 9296 4962 respectively) will be raised with appropriate staff for action.

CS noted noise investigations underway focus on at-source mitigation, house façade treatment, shore power and a noise wall. A risk assessment for the operational noise reduction options has been prepared and the next steps are how to implement safely and to organise a trial. The risk assessment report is with Carnival Australia for review.

Residents noted that variable speed fans appear to make the engine noise more pronounced. KC said ship noise has affected the wellbeing of residents. She added, "The constraints and controls of Carnival's Good Neighbour Policy (sic) simply aren't working."

AR commented, "There is nothing in the way of a goodwill gesture from Carnival."

It was noted that information from Ausgrid for the shore power feasibility study is critical. A report expected early 2016. Port Authority's CEO met with Ausgrid's COO regarding this issue.

AR requested copy of information sent by Port of Oslo regarding shore power investigations.

JJ noted an air quality monitoring station would be established for WBCT shortly (corner of Grafton and Adolphus Street).

FG noted there had been a positive change from Carnival in terms of their interaction with EPA.

Further noted that shore power and noise are priorities for Port Authority to investigate.

**Action:** Port Authority to enquire with Department of Premier and Cabinet as to whether there is as appropriate contact for the community.

---

## 7. Update from NSW EPA

FG advised the EPA is working towards the 1 October 2015 deadline for the Clean Air Regulation requiring cruise ships to use low sulphur fuel whilst at berth in Sydney Harbour and to expect announcements in the coming weeks. EPA received approximately 160 submissions to address.

Further noted that two additional staff have been engaged in the compliance section of the EPA. The EPA is anticipating full compliance with the new regulation and expects to have compliance 'trial runs' with ships prior to 1 October 2015. There will be a record of compliance and a requirement that samples of fuels be kept.

---

---

EPA would like to hold a community meeting in Balmain on 15 or 16 September regarding the Regulation. K Horrobin to come back with information on logistics of meeting.

It was also noted there would be a webpage on the Regulation, one for Community and another for Industry. There will also be brochures and other materials provided to ships. LM requested advance warning prior to the website going live.

**Action:** K Horrobin to provide advice to EPA on meeting logistics.

---

**8. Update from DP&E**

K Harragon noted DP&E are working with Port Authority on noise mitigation strategy, shore power, and vibration. First priority is to rectify operational noise at source before making any changes to housing. K Harragon added that they are being kept up to date on progress by the Port Authority, and that DP&E has a high level of confidence that it will be able to make a clear and informed decision on shore power and operational noise mitigation.

---

**9. Update from NSW Health**

K Horrobin asked what is expected to improve with low sulfur fuel regulation. AS noted that low sulphur fuel is more refined which reduces both particle and sulfur dioxide emissions. It was noted that residents should see a significant change in emissions with low sulphur fuel. RB advised PM<sub>2.5</sub> has the more significant health impact.

Port Authority monitoring on corner of Grafton and Adolphus streets will include PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions and the results will be on the website. Monitoring also measures SO<sub>2</sub> and wind speed and direction.

CS noted that a second monitoring station was previously installed further into the residential area, and it was demonstrated that the monitoring station closest to the Terminal (at Grafton Street) had higher readings.

RB advised that a paper has been prepared which looks at air pollution and cruise ships generally, and also a second paper on chemical dispersion.

The paper will be peer reviewed and it is anticipated it will be published before the end of the year.

FG also noted that the EPA's DNV study is being finalised.

**Action:** K Horrobin to circulate paper regarding low sulphur fuel.

**Action:** RB to provide abstract of health assessment report if available.

---

**10. Next Meeting**

The next meeting will be held on Friday 16 October 2015 at NSW Health Department in Camperdown.

**Action:** Meeting to be arranged by NSW Health.

---

**Next meeting date**     16 October 2015



**Christa Sams**  
Environment Operations Manager  
Port Authority of NSW