



Architectural Excellence & Design Review Panel

Meeting Minutes & Recommendations

Site Address:	18-22 Dalmar Street Croydon
Proposal:	Part demolition of existing buildings, construction of a three storey residential flat building at the rear of an existing building (through Existing Use Rights)
Application No.:	DA 2022 0309
Meeting Date:	21 June 2022
Previous Meeting Date:	-
Panel Members:	Matthew Pullinger – chair; Jon Johannsen; and Jocelyn Jackson
Apologies:	-
Council staff:	Vishal Lakhia; Niall Macken; Katerina Lianos; and Adele Cowie
Guests:	-
Declarations of Interest:	None
Applicant or applicant's representatives to address the panel:	Sam Tadros – Architect for the project

Background:

1. The Architectural Excellence & Design Review Panel reviewed the architectural drawings and discussed the proposal with the applicant through an online conference.
2. The Panel notes that the subject site is zoned R2 low density residential, in which residential flat buildings are prohibited under the Inner West Council's LEP. As an existing residential apartment building, the proposal seeks to rely upon 'existing use rights' for the proposed addition of 3 apartments and internal alterations of the 4 existing apartments (for a total 7 apartments) on



the subject site. In such cases it is imperative that there is due consideration of design resolution that ensures that the qualities of the R2 zone and desired future character are not compromised.

Discussion & Recommendations:

1. In summary, the Panel is not satisfied with the proposed site planning strategy and is concerned it represents the overdevelopment of a small site in an otherwise low density residential environment, results in poor residential amenity and creates adverse built form amenity impacts on adjoining residential properties. The Panel's concerns are further discussed in the following report:
2. The Panel is concerned with the proposed building separation distances, which are below the minimum requirements of the NSW Apartment Design Guide (ADG) Parts 2F building separation and 3F visual privacy. The constrained building separation distances create amenity concerns including for visual and acoustic privacy, available outlook, natural ventilation and daylight access for future residents within the proposal and existing residents within the adjoining properties.
3. The Panel expressed concern regarding overshadowing impacts on the private open space and or habitable areas of the adjoining residential dwelling house located south of the subject site (No. 2 Burns Street). The applicant should demonstrate that any loss of solar access is limited to a maximum of 20%, based on the ADG 3B-2 criteria.
4. The Panel notes the location of the circulation core, including the lift and staircase, is not legible from the public domain. Furthermore, barrier-free access should be provided to the common circulation areas, particularly a wheelchair-compliant lift. In terms of the pedestrian circulation the Panel identifies potential conflicts for pedestrians and vehicular movement along the side-drive.
5. The proposed core location breaks the roof form and side wall alignment of the existing apartment building, and the Panel encourages a more sympathetic resolution between existing and new work.
6. Location of the communal open space at the rear is problematic as it will result in potential noise spill into adjoining properties due to the extent of hard surfaced under-croft areas, and limited scope for landscaping.
7. The Panel is concerned for the resultant residential amenity achieved by the new apartments, mainly since the proposal is not consistent with the principal ADG criteria for mid-winter solar access required to a minimum 70% apartments (ADG Part 4A).
8. The constrained floor-to-ceiling and floor-to-floor heights are below the requirements of the NSW ADG Part 4C. The Panel expects the proposal to achieve a minimum 2.7m floor-to-ceiling heights within all habitable areas (consistent with the ADG). The proposed floor to floor heights should also be reviewed to ensure compliance is capable with the new Design and Building Practitioners Act, and the related building performance requirements. The Panel understands a 3.1m to 3.2m floor-to-floor height would better achieve compliance with the NCC and result in ceiling heights consistent with the ADG. Additionally, the floor-to-floor heights should allow provision of ceiling fans as low-energy cooling alternative for the proposal.
9. The Panel expressed concern regarding usability and functionality of the internal apartment spaces, whether realistically scaled furniture layouts can be provided with adequate circulation space. A lack of outlook for Unit 7 bedroom is considered to be problematic.
10. The Panel is not convinced the proposal has given the required consideration to structural resolution (e.g. resolution of columns, beams, adequate slab depths and the like) and integration of building services (e.g. acoustics, waterproofing, insulation, electrical, plumbing and stormwater) within the proposal. The Panel also identified potential issues with transfer of services from the residential levels to the ground floor via the under-croft area. These issues are exaggerated given the compressed building heights proposed.

INNER WEST

11. Proposed locations for A/C condensers should be confirmed on the architectural drawings. The Panel prefers A/C condenser units not be located within the balconies (unless appropriately screened for visual and acoustic impacts) or anywhere visually apparent within the public domain.
12. The Panel supports the general architectural expression and character proposed for the rear addition and further recommends that intervention into the existing roof should be minimised or eliminated.
13. Despite the Panel's in principle support for the proposed architectural expression, the fundamental concerns raised by the Panel should be resolved. It is the Panel's view that the proposal, in its current state, cannot be supported as it does not meet the standard of residential amenity expected from a contemporary proposal for a residential flat building within the Inner West local government area.